

Message

From: Murphy, Deirdre [Murphy.Deirdre@epa.gov]
Sent: 7/9/2018 8:28:03 PM
To: Bussard, David [Bussard.David@epa.gov]
CC: Ohanian, Edward [Ohanian.Edward@epa.gov]; Lowit, Anna [Lowit.Anna@epa.gov]; Firestone, Michael [Firestone.Michael@epa.gov]; Axelrad, Daniel [Axelrad.Daniel@epa.gov]; Raffaele, Kathleen [raffaele.kathleen@epa.gov]; Martin, Lawrence [Martin.Lawrence@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: RAF - Additivity Paper Review ☺-with file
Attachments: Additivity Report 5-25-18-dlm-thruEnd.docx

From: Murphy, Deirdre
Sent: Monday, July 09, 2018 4:27 PM
To: Bussard, David <Bussard.David@epa.gov>
Cc: Ohanian, Edward <Ohanian.Edward@epa.gov>; Lowit, Anna <Lowit.Anna@epa.gov>; Firestone, Michael <Firestone.Michael@epa.gov>; Axelrad, Daniel <Axelrad.Daniel@epa.gov>; Raffaele, Kathleen <raffaele.kathleen@epa.gov>; Martin, Lawrence <Martin.Lawrence@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: RAF - Additivity Paper Review ☺

David and Lawrence,

Per my note from Tuesday, here's the file with remainder of my comments. [FYI, I only added to the file I previously sent (no modifications to comments I'd had in Tues file).]
I hope these are clear and helpful.

Thanks!

Deirdre

p.s. Please forgive any messiness (which is resulting from haste in awareness of the timeline).

From: Murphy, Deirdre
Sent: Tuesday, July 03, 2018 4:10 PM
To: Bussard, David <Bussard.David@epa.gov>
Cc: Ohanian, Edward <Ohanian.Edward@epa.gov>; Lowit, Anna <Lowit.Anna@epa.gov>; Firestone, Michael <Firestone.Michael@epa.gov>; Axelrad, Daniel <Axelrad.Daniel@epa.gov>; Raffaele, Kathleen <raffaele.kathleen@epa.gov>; Martin, Lawrence <Martin.Lawrence@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: RAF - Additivity Paper Review ☺

David and Lawrence,

As the amount of new text and presentations in the document has made the going slower than expected, I'm unfortunately sending a partial review today (I'm out rest of week).
But I will send the remainder by the end of the day on Monday, July 9.

Consistent with our impression from Glenn's presentation, the overhaul generally makes the document much cleaner and easy to follow!

Happy Independence Day!

Deirdre

From: Martin, Lawrence
Sent: Friday, June 29, 2018 10:27 AM
To: Lowit, Anna <Lowit.Anna@epa.gov>; Murphy, Deirdre <Murphy.Deirdre@epa.gov>; Bussard, David

<Bussard.David@epa.gov>; Firestone, Michael <Firestone.Michael@epa.gov>; Axelrad, Daniel
<Axelrad.Daniel@epa.gov>; Raffaele, Kathleen <raffaele.kathleen@epa.gov>

Cc: Ohanian, Edward <Ohanian.Edward@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: RAF - Additivity Paper Review (2)

From: Martin, Lawrence

Sent: Friday, June 22, 2018 10:31 AM

To: Lowit, Anna; Murphy, Deirdre; Bussard, David; Firestone, Michael; Axelrad, Daniel; Raffaele, Kathleen

Cc: Ohanian, Edward

Subject: RAF - Additivity Paper Review [Reminder]

Additivity Review Team:

This is a reminder that the following is requested by July 6th.

- any additional comments on the revised draft of the Additivity Paper ([here](#));
- a *straw* concurrence statement on whether you think the paper is ready to advance to the STPC for their concurrence on moving the document to external peer review; and
- any comments and responses in the initial response to comments doc for which you would like explanation of how they were finally responded to in the revised draft.

• Details below.

•

• **From:** Martin, Lawrence

Sent: Thursday, May 31, 2018 9:20 AM

Subject: RAF - Additivity Paper Review Team Call [with instructions]

• • Additivity Paper Review Team Members:

July 23 was the earliest date and time following final review when all Review Team Members were free to participate. The paper appears well positioned to move to the next stage of review, and with everyone's participation the Review Team might be able to reach agreement on 7/23. Please try to reserve this hour on your calendar.

Please provide any additional comments on the revised draft of the Additivity Paper (link below) by July 6th.

- We ask that you provide comments using track changes comment bubbles in the document itself. This facilitates creation of a matrix of collated comments. If you open the document link and select edit in MS Word (not the on-line edit mode) then your comments should all be saved to the linked document. Because this process is not fool-proof, also please save a copy of the document and your comments to your own computer and send me a copy as a back-up (its fine if other's comments are mixed in with your).
- Also, please provide a *straw* concurrence statement on whether you think the paper is ready to advance to the STPC for their concurrence on moving the document to external peer review. Your options for a straw concurrence statement are:
 - Concur
 - Concur with comments
 - Non-concur with comments
- The writing team will review the comments, make agreed-to edits, and flag any comments that need discussion on our 7/23 call.

If there are comments and responses in the initial response to comments doc (link below) for which you would like the writing team's explanation of how they were finally responded to in the revised draft, please flag them in an email to Glen and me by July 6.

The revised draft of the Additivity Paper is parked [here](#).

The initial response to comments provided to the review team 11/14/17 is parked [here](#).

A link to the recording of our 6/12 call will be sent in a separate email. Please call me if you have any questions.

Thanks,
Lawrence

Lawrence Martin
U.S. EPA Office of Science Advisor
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW (8105-R)
Washington, DC 20460
☎ 202.564.6497
AWL☎ 202.308.5642